

RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF PETALUMA HISTORIC & CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE RECOMMENDING THE BARN COMPLEX LANDMARK DESIGNATION TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION ASSOCIATED WITH THE SCOTT RANCH PROJECT LOCATED ON A ± 47-ACRE PORTION OF PARCEL B OF THE SCOTT RANCH SUBDIVISION PROJECT ADJACENT TO KELLY CREEK AND D STREET, LOCATED AT 1860 D STREET; APN 019-120-041; FILE NO. PLLD-2023-0000

WHEREAS, in 2004 Davidon Homes submitted an application to the City of Petaluma for a 93-lot residential project located on two parcels (APN 019-120-040 and -041) and consisting of 58.66 acres at the corner of D Street and Windsor Drive and adjacent to the Halen Putnam Regional Park ("Prior Project"); and

WHEREAS, after initial review, it was determined that an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) was required based on significant biological impacts associated with the habitat for the red-legged frog; and

WHEREAS, on August 11, 2004, and August 25, 2004, scoping meetings were held to initiate the environmental review process and solicit public comment regarding the environmental analysis to be undertaken; and

WHEREAS, the Draft EIR (DEIR) was released on February 14, 2013, for public comment; and

WHEREAS, on April 15, 2013, the City Council directed staff to proceed with the preparation of a Final EIR (FEIR) and to provide additional information and clarification addressing comments on the DEIR and further analysis on the reduced project alternative; and

WHEREAS, in response to comments received on the 2013 DEIR, the applicant elected to submit a revised project with a reduced development proposal including 66-single family residential lots with associated private and public open spaces, a public park with a multi-use trail, a Class I trail along D Street, trailhead parking lots, and other infrastructure such as sidewalks, a roundabout, and sewer, water, and storm drainage infrastructure; and

WHEREAS, the City initiated the preparation of a revised DEIR (2017 RDEIR) for the 66-lot project scope and circulated it for public comment; and

WHEREAS, the City Council considered the 2017 RDEIR on June 19, 2017, and determined that the 2017 RDEIR was inadequate and that additional analysis was needed prior to the preparation of a Final EIR, and the Council by motion directed staff to revise the 2017 RDEIR to include a more robust evaluation of the 28-lot "Environmentally Preferred" alternative that was included in the 2017 RDEIR; and

WHEREAS, in June 2018, the Kelly Creek Protection Project (KCPP) of Earth Island Institute announced that it had entered into an agreement with Davidon Homes in response to comments received on the 2017 RDEIR, and Davidon Homes and KCPP ("Applicants") submitted

a revised application to the City of Petaluma for a 28-lot residential project on approximately 15 acres, along with proposed dedication of approximately 44 acres of the overall project site to Sonoma County Regional Parks as an extension to the Helen Putnam Regional Park; and

WHEREAS, entitlements submitted by the Applicants included (1) a General Plan Amendment to modify General Plan Policy 2-P-68 and Figure 5-2, (2) a Zoning Map Amendment to rezone the project site from Residential 1 (R1) to a Planned Unit District (PUD), (3) a Zoning Text Amendment to adopt the Scott Ranch Planned Unit Development Plan and Guidelines, and (5) a Vesting Tentative Subdivision Map (VTSM) to subdivide the project parcels into residential, open space, public access, and parking lot; and

WHEREAS, subsequent entitlements for the development of the Scott Ranch project include Site Plan and Architectural Review (SPAR) required for development of the single-family homes, associated landscaping, and lighting in the residential component, and for public improvements proposed as part of the Putnam Park Extension Project component, a Tentative Parcel Map¹ to divide Parcel B as shown in the VTSM for dedication to the Sonoma County Regional Parks, and for designation of a historic landmark to designate the barn complex as a local historic resource; and

WHEREAS, the City prepared and distributed copies of a 2020 RDEIR that analyzed the revised reduced 28-lot project, including the proposed General Plan Amendments; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission held a public hearing on February 9, 2021, to consider the 2020 RDEIR for the revised project with a reduced 28-lot residential component, the purpose of the hearing being to inform the public about the contents of the 2020 RDEIR and to receive oral comments about the adequacy and accuracy of the 2020 RDEIR; and

WHEREAS, the City Council held a public hearing on March 15, 2021, to consider the 2020 RDEIR, the purpose of the hearings being to inform the public about the contents of the 2020 RDEIR and to receive oral comments about the adequacy and accuracy of the 2020 RDEIR; and

WHEREAS, at the March 15, 2021, hearing the City Council directed that a Final EIR be prepared addressing comments and concerns raised during public comment on the 2020 RDEIR; and

WHEREAS, additional modifications to the project were made by the applicant to the proposed project in response to comments received during the discussion of the 2020 RDEIR, most specifically to reduce further the footprint of the residential component of the project; and

WHEREAS, the revised “Environmentally Preferred” residential component includes a 28-lot single-family residential subdivision, and the park component includes an increase to approximately 47 acres of open space/parkland, including multi-use trails north and south of Kelly

¹ As the tentative parcel map proposes to create two parcels, its approval would be conducted administratively, anticipated to occur following approval of the Vesting Tentative Subdivision Map.

creek connecting the existing barn complex on the east of the site to the existing Helen Putnam Regional Park to the west; and

WHEREAS, offsite public improvements proposed as part of the project include a roundabout on City right-of-way at the intersection of D Street and Windsor Drive and an approximately 800-foot offsite sidewalk gap closure on the east side of D Street between Windsor Drive and Sunnyslope Avenue; and

WHEREAS, the Revised Project continues to provide for a planned future offsite trail segment connecting the Scott Ranch property with the existing trail within Helen Putnam Regional Park; and

WHEREAS, the Revised Project boundaries remain unchanged, and refinements to the project are limited to reducing the building development footprint by further clustering lots, reducing setbacks and building sizes; and

WHEREAS, the environmental effects of the Revised Project have been analyzed and compared to the environmental effects presented in the 2020 RDEIR, and that analysis has been included in the Final EIR; and

WHEREAS, on February 4, 2021, the Applicants held a neighborhood meeting to create dialogue with community members, provide information and updates on the Project, and address concerns; and

WHEREAS, on October 6, 2021, the Pedestrian and Bicycle Advisory Committee (PBAC) considered and provided feedback on the pedestrian and bicycle facilities proposed by the project, including sidewalks and pedestrian crossings, bicycle rack location, access and connectivity to Helen Putnam Regional Park, trail alignments and features, and the proposed amendment to General Plan Figure 5-2, Bicycle Facilities; and

WHEREAS, on October 20, 2021, the Recreation Music and Park Commission (RMPC) considered and provided feedback on the Helen Putnam Regional Park expansion, Barn Center improvements, playground, amphitheater, picnic areas, multi-use trails, and other amenities proposed as part of the Putnam Park Extension component of the project; and

WHEREAS, on June 20, 2022, onsite signage was posted informing residents of the availability of the Final EIR, project entitlements, and the Planning Commission hearing on the project; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission held a duly noticed public meeting on July 12, 2022, at which time it continued the item to a date certain of August 9, 2022; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission held a duly noticed public hearing on August 9, 2022 at which time it considered the Final EIR and project entitlements, accepted public testimony, and approved Resolution No. 2022- 08 recommending that the City Council certify the EIR; and

WHEREAS, on February 16, 2023, onsite signage was posted informing residents of the availability of the Final EIR, project entitlements, and the City Council hearing on the project; and

WHEREAS, the City Council held a duly noticed public hearing on February 27, 2023, at which time it considered the Final EIR and project entitlements and accepted public testimony; and

WHEREAS, at the February 27, 2023, public hearing, the City Council approved Resolution No. 2023- 023 N.C. S. certifying the EIR, making findings of fact to adopt a statement of overriding considerations, and adopting a mitigation monitoring and reporting program for the Scott Ranch Project; and

WHEREAS, within Resolution No. 2023-025 N.C.S., which approved the Vesting Tentative Subdivision Map Condition of Approval #10, requires City Council's determination of Local Landmark Designation of the "red barn complex", consistent with General Policy 2-P-68 for the preservation of the uniqueness of the property at the intersection of D Street and Windsor Drive (Scott Ranch); and

WHEREAS, on May 24, 2023, a Landmark Designation application for the barn complex was received by the Planning Division; and

WHEREAS, a public notice of the Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee hearing was published in the Petaluma Argus-Courier on August 25, 2023, and

WHEREAS, on or before August 26, 2023, onsite signage was posted informing residents of the barn complex landmark designation recommendation and the Historic & Cultural Preservation Committee hearing on the project; and

WHEREAS, the Historic & Cultural Preservation Committee held a duly noticed public hearing on September 5, 2023, at which time it considered the barn complex landmark designation recommendation and accepted public testimony;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT:

- A. The foregoing recitals are true and correct and incorporated herein into this resolution as findings of the Petaluma Historic Cultural Preservation Committee.
- B. Based on the staff report, staff presentation, comments received, and the public hearing, the Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee makes the following findings based on substantial evidence in the record:

California Environmental Quality Act

1. An Environmental Impact Report for the Scott Ranch project, inclusive of the local landmark designation, was certified by the City Council on February 27, 2023 (SCH #2004072137). Additionally, the Project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15308 for Class 8 - Actions by Regulatory Agencies, which includes actions taken by regulatory agencies to assure protection of the environment, such as landmark designation of a historic resource.

Petaluma General Plan

2. The Project is consistent with the site's Land Use Map designation Residential 3(R3) in that a Major HSPAR application for exterior alterations to a historic structure was submitted on October 4, 2022, as required, which would result in alterations to an existing two-story residential building on an approximately 3,870 square foot lot.
3. The project is, for the reasons contained in the September 5, 2023, Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee staff report, consistent with the following General Plan policies:

Policy 1-P-3 Preserve the overall scale and character of established residential neighborhoods.

Policy 2-P-68 Preserve the uniqueness of the property at the intersection of D Street and Windsor Drive (Scott Ranch) through incorporation of the following criteria in the future development process:

- Respect the gateway value with a minimum 100' building setback from D Street with no sound walls but allow small accessory structures as part of the public park amenities.
- Maintain a minimum of a 100' building setback from the centerline of Kelly Creek and its tributaries, recognizing that existing barns may remain within the setback.
- Preserve the barn complex, designate the complex historic, and encourage the incorporation of a nature study area. Relocation in the same general area for purposes of stabilization and preservation shall be allowed.
- Preserve and maintain habitat areas and trees.
- Avoid slide areas and minimize grading.
- Provide a minimum 300'-wide Urban Separator.
- Provide a minimum of a 3-acre park site.
- Include the provision of trailhead facilities with restrooms and parking with a connection to Helen Putnam Regional Park.
- Respect City hillside regulations.

Policy 3-P-1 Protect historic and archaeological resources for the aesthetic, cultural, educational, environmental, economic, and scientific contribution they make to maintaining and enhancing Petaluma's character, identity and quality of life.

4. The Historic & Cultural Preservation Committee hereby recommends that the barn complex landmark designation to the Planning Commission as directed by General Policy 2-P-68, preserves the uniqueness of the property at the intersection of D Street and Windsor Drive (Scott Ranch), specifically, by preserving the barn complex, designating the complex

historic, and encouraging the incorporation of a nature study area. Relocation in the same general area for purposes of stabilization and preservation shall be allowed.

5. The Historic & Cultural Preservation Committee finds that the recommended barn complex landmark designation is in the public interest as it protects a historic resource for the aesthetic, cultural, educational, environmental, economic, and scientific contribution they make to maintaining and enhancing Petaluma's character, identity and, quality of life, pursuant to General Policy 3-P-1.

Implementing Zoning Ordinance

6. The Project does not modify the site's General Plan Land Use Map designation of Very Low Density Residential (R VL) or the site's Planned Unit zoning district (PUD), in that a barn complex landmark designation application for the existing barn complex, which would include three existing barn structures, proposes the landmark designation only on the three existing barn structures, and would be subject to IZO Chapter 15. The overall property site of Parcel B of the Scott Ranch project would not be modified for the landmark designation.
7. The project is consistent with Chapter 15 (Preservation of the Cultural and Historic Environment), in that it has been reviewed by the HCPC in accordance with the requirements contained in Section 15.070 of the IZO, and it has been determined that the proposed alterations will not adversely affect the character, or the historical, architectural, or aesthetic interest or value of the district.
8. Recommendation of the barn complex landmark designation as outlined in the staff report and draft resolution is contingent upon Planning Commission recommendation and ultimately is at the discretion of the City Council as the landmark designation is a zoning amendment.
9. The Historic & Cultural Preservation Committee finds the barn complex period of significance is from the late 19th century to the mid-20th century is significant due to its association with Petaluma's agricultural past as the barn structures were used for agricultural purposes and its setting is within Petaluma's rolling hills.
10. The Historic & Cultural Preservation Committee finds the barn complex features to include, but not limited to:

Contributing Features:

- *Horizontal wood siding*
- *Gable roofs*
- *Wood framed windows*
- *Openings of doors and windows*
- *Concrete piers*
- *Configuration of barn structures*

Non-Contributing Features:

- *Interior spaces*

- C. Based on its review of the entire record herein, including the September 5, 2023, Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee staff report, all supporting, referenced, and incorporated documents, and all comments received, the Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee hereby recommends the Landmark Designation to Planning Commission for the Project, subject to the conditions of approval attached hereto as **Exhibit 1**.

EXHIBIT 1.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL
Barn Complex Landmark Designation
1860 D Street
APN: 019-120-041
File No: PLLD-2023-0000

The Historic & Cultural Preservation Committee recommends the following conditions applied to the barn complex landmark designation:

1. Following the barn complex landmark designation approval by the Petaluma City Council, the Project is filed with the Northwest Information Center (NWIC), and the Project's CEQA Notice of Exemption ("NOE") is filed with the Sonoma County Clerk's Office.
2. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible to avoid damage to the historic materials.
3. The Project is required to comply with measures to protect and preserve significant archeological resources if potentially significant prehistoric or historic archeological resources are encountered during the course of ground-disturbing activities.
4. Demonstrating compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, administrative review is allowed for the three barn structures for:
 - a. Maintenance and repairs.
 - b. Stabilization, including relocation in the same general area.
 - c. Future rehabilitation for the Putnam Park Extension project.
5. The configuration of the barn complex, which establishes a relationship between the three structures, shall be preserved.
6. Discretionary review would be applicable for demolition pursuant to Resolution No. 2017-122 and for demolition of the barn complex's contributing features. The barn complex's contributing features include horizontal wood siding, gable roofs, wood framed windows, openings of doors and windows, concrete piers, and its configuration of barn structures. The barn complex's interior spaces are non-contributing features.